Evidence on Pushing Frontiers in Gender and Financial Inclusion

Sarah Gammage, ICRW
Grace Majara, CARE International
Brett Matthews, My Oral Village
Rosita Najmi, Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation
Jaya Tiwari, The BOMA Project
Neeraj Trivedi, IFMR-Lead
Data and Resilience

Rosita Najmi

Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation
Sex-Disaggregated Data helps us better understand:

- Women’s Unique **Time Poverty**
- Contributions of Women’s **Invisible Work** (Household and Economy)
- **Supply Side Barriers** to Women’s Access of Financial Services
- **Demand Side Barriers** to Women’s Usage of Financial Services
- **Financial Consumer Protection Needs**

And allows us to:

- Create evidence-based **regulations, policy, and advocacy**
- Apply alternative data to secure **eligibility for financial products and services**
- Measure **impact** of interventions
Examples of Gender Data Investments:
Data and Resilience: Financial Inclusion of Women in Rural, Last Mile Communities

Jaya Tiwari
The BOMA Project
Data and Resilience
Linkages to DFS Within Model

MOBILE PHONE

FINANCIAL SKILLS TRAINING

REGISTERED M-PESA ACCOUNT
Data and Resilience

Challenges

- Illiteracy
- Numeracy
- Digital Proficiency
- Multiple and insecure PINs
- Customer service language
- Autonomy
- Liquidity

- Network connections
- Preference for cash
- Fear of phone loss
- Lack of financial infrastructure
Data and Resilience
Findings

Participants:

1. Can accurately count cash into the thousands
2. Struggled to recognize written numbers, mathematical operators, understand place value
3. Are unable to use calculators or accurately do mental addition or subtraction with four- and five-digit numbers.
Data and Resilience
Recommendations and Conclusions

1. Make DFS products *simple and more accessible*
2. Create *alternative verification steps*
3. Develop savings products that give users more confidence that they can be responsible for money
4. Keep PINs *private*
5. Encourage *autonomy*
Data Solutions and Oral Information Management

Brett Matthews
My Oral Village
How are we using data to track progress in building resilience for women?

• There are **a billion illiterate adults** in the world: **2/3 are women**.
  • There are at least as many financially innumerate adults as illiterate ones

• When illiterate and innumerate women are able to use data they **build their own resilience**.

• If women can keep their own records, we will be able to gather better records of their efforts, and be better able to craft effective strategies that support resilience.
## 5 Steps to Financial Numeracy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Steps</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Number recognition</td>
<td>Read and write 1-digit numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Place value (large numbers)</td>
<td>Read and write numbers up to local use-needs (about $1,000 US in local currency terms)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Written calculations</td>
<td>Learn the arithmetic operators (+ - x ÷ =) and how to use the calculator on a feature phone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Data entry</td>
<td>Writing or inputting financial concepts on paper or a mobile phone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Calendar time</td>
<td>Learn to use calendars, date notation (&quot;14/7/18&quot;) and tabular syntax</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Using 1-digit numbers
2. Using long numbers (more than 1 digit)
3. Inputting text
4. Written calculations
5. Calendar time
Empowering Women through Direct Digital Payments

Neeraj Trivedi
IFMR-Lead
Empowering Women through Direct Digital Payments
Measuring what matters

- **Context:** Low female labor force participation, limited female mobility and empowerment, conservative social norms

- **Policy Opportunity:** Government opening bank accounts last mile banking kiosks at scale

- **Research Question:** How do Direct Benefit Transfers payments into individual (rather than household) accounts affect women’s wellbeing?

- **Our Study:** RCT in Madhya Pradesh India

- Measured the usual banking outcomes but also...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measuring labor supply</th>
<th>Measuring empowerment</th>
<th>Measuring norms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>In the workfare program:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Economic agency:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Actual norms:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-reported in past month/year</td>
<td>Purchases of food, clothing, children's health, home improvement etc.</td>
<td>“Can women go out and work”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages in past month/year</td>
<td><strong>Mobility:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Actual social costs:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In the private market:</strong></td>
<td>Visited market, natal home, etc. in last 30 days</td>
<td>Vignettes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-reported</td>
<td><strong>Decision-making:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Perceived social costs:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Isolate labor supply effects from labor demand effects</strong></td>
<td>Has a say in spending etc.</td>
<td>How many women will poorly judge working woman/her husband</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Using data to build resilience for women

Grace Majara
CARE International
• **Existing structural barriers and social norms** affect women’s autonomy and participating equally financial decision making.

• Financial services can **reduce the gender access gap** and **advance women’s economic empowerment**.

• Promotion of community-based savings groups as contextualised in two case examples:
  - **LINK Up Project**
    - Financial education & formal financial products
    - Leveraged “alternative channels”
  - **Digital Sub-Wallets Project**
    - Household dialogues
    - Financial planning
    - Digital product
LINK Up
13,165 SGs; 322,000 members

• **Findings:**
  • Increased control over resources and ability to achieve financial goals
  • Better returns on savings
  • Privacy
  • Group accounts increased individual account ownership
  • Varying degrees of trust and transparency in their households

• **Key lesson:**
  • Access to a bank account provided **privacy to maintain control** over earnings and savings but **not sufficient for gender norm change**
Digital Sub-Wallets

• **Findings:**
  - Significant changes in household relationship dynamics and increased participation in financial planning and decision-making
  - Diverse family structures have unique needs

• **Key lessons:**
  - Need to address both financial **product design** and **household gender dynamics**
  - **Partnerships** between diverse actors can create enabling environment
  - **Training** is a key factor for success of both staff and participants
  - Engage women at **every step** to identify barriers throughout the process of implementation